# MINUTES OF THE REGULAR SESSION OF THE MALDEN SCHOOL COMMITTEE

Monday, June 6, 2022

# Herbert L. Jackson Council Chamber Room #106 - 215 Pleasant Street And Virtual Meeting

Mayor Christenson called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. Mayor Christenson read the docket items for the meeting.

Mayor Christenson led the committee in the Pledge of Allegiance followed by a moment of silence for those who have served our country and for those who continue to do so.

## **Roll Call**

The following attendance was taken:

Mayor Christenson Present Mr. Drummey Present Mr. McCarthy Present Ms. Spadafora Present Ms. Macklin Present Mr. Weldai Present Mr. Grav Present Mr. Bernard Present Ms. Rose-Zeiberg Present Superintendent Noriega-Murphy Present Student Representative Jean Absent Clerk Present

Mayor Christenson invited Mr. Danyal Najmi from Rosetta Languages to provide details about joining the language access channels for the meeting.

### **Approval of Minutes**

Mayor Christenson brought forth the matter of the approval of minutes for the May 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2022 Regular Session of the School Committee. Ms. Spadafora made the motion to approve the minutes. Mr. McCarthy seconded and it was so VOTED. Motion passed unanimously.

## **Public Comment**

Mayor Christenson said that due to the large gathering, the public comment section of the meeting will be limited to 45 minutes and each speaker will have a maximum of two minutes.

Ms. Deb Gesualdo, President of the Malden Education Association (MEA)

Ms. Gesualdo invited members of the audience to join her in a choral reading. Ms. Gesualdo continued that a grassroots movement of the rank and file members of the MEA educators in all the schools and

worksites across the district drafted and edited a resolution. Ms. Gesualdo said the motion was put on the floor of a general membership meeting and amendments were made to the resolution. The motion passed. The members of the MEA took the vote of no confidence against Superintendent Noriega-Murphy. The resolution detailed the Superintendent's unsatisfactory performance during the 2021-2022 school year, her undermining of public education as the cornerstone of democracy and attack on organized labor. The resolution was read by different rank and file MEA members. The resolution included that confidence in Superintendent Noriega-Murphy's ability to run the school district can only begin to be resolved when and if non-renewals are rescinded, schools are staffed to a level that workers, students and parents/caregivers deem acceptable, respect and consistently demonstrate transparency and good faith in dealings with students, workers, labor unions and community based hiring decision making. Ms. Gesualdo concluded that if these criteria are not met, Superintendent Noriega-Murphy should tender her resignation or be terminated by the Malden School Committee.

## Ms. Isabel Eddy, 58 Bloomberg Street, Malden

Ms. Eddy asked the School Committee to publicly support Superintendent Noriega-Murphy and her team as they work to create opportunities for all Malden Public Schools (MPS) students. Ms. Eddy highlighted some accomplishments and asked the School Committee to continue working with the Superintendent and her team to create policies and practices for MPS that are transparent and equitable. Ms. Eddy said that the Superintendent has done exactly what the community asked her to do when she was hired. Ms. Eddy continued that many areas of need were not addressed by the previous district administration. Ms. Eddy said that when the Superintendent took this job, she did not sign up for personal attacks, misleading rhetoric and lies.

#### Ms. Anabette D'Entremont, 16 Preston Street, Malden

Ms. D'Entremont said that Superintendent Noriega-Murphy has done tremendous work for the school department. Ms. D'Entremont voiced her disappointment for the way people have addressed the Superintendent and the way the union has treated her. Ms. D'Entremont said that everyone should put the students first.

### Ms. Fern Remedi-Brown, 21 Ivy Road, Malden

Ms. Remedi-Brown said that it is not enough to cite the diversity in Malden without ensuring that the students are represented by educators who look like them and come from similar backgrounds. Ms. Remedi-Brown continued that 92% of educators in Malden are white serving Massachusetts most diverse population. Ms. Remedi-Brown added that Superintendent Noriega-Murphy is committed to equity in hiring and retention of all Malden educators regardless of race or demographics. Ms. Remedi-Brown said that although we want our students to have the best possible experiences and outcomes in our public education system, we are unwilling to stand behind and work together with the extremely capable BIPOC (Black, Indigenous, and people of color) superintendents that have served our district. Ms. Remedi-Brown said that what should be done is to explore and discuss ways to work together with the Superintendent for a functional and beneficial school system for our students and educators.

## Christina Anasthal, Malden High School (MHS) Student

Christina said that she was speaking on behalf of the MHS staff and district workers who received pink slips. Christina continued that the Superintendent made the decision for the students to let these staff members go without consulting the students. Christina said one of the staff members who received a pink slip was the Jenkins House Social Worker at MHS, Ms. Taysia Holmes, who helped her since she came to the high school. Since Kindergarten up to freshman year at MHS, Christina said that she had

only met three black women educators in the school system which includes Ms. Holmes. Christina asked that these educators be given their jobs back.

### Sarah Pham and Lovely Anne Gerochi, MHS Students

Sarah said that she is angry and frustrated with the Superintendent because there is no reason why Study classes are full and Italian classes was not offered for two weeks. Lovely said that this situation affects the students the most. She added that the schools are understaffed already and now it is worse with the pink slips. Both students asked that the schools be fully staffed and wanted their teachers back.

### Ms. Michele Luong, Former School Committee Member

Ms. Luong said that she always supported teachers and had the best interests of the students in mind. Ms. Luong found it distressing that just one year after coming back from the COVID-19 pandemic, instead of coming together as a community, we are divided in actions, goals and truth. Ms. Luong asked what example is being set for students when they and their parents are given half-truths, sensationalized accusations and not all the facts. Ms. Luong said that to teach our students to have a voice, we need to properly expose them to actions that encourage that voice. Ms. Luong continued that she has full confidence in Superintendent Noriega-Murphy, School Committee and the community. She added that she is confident that the Superintendent will succeed in all that she has promised. In closing, Ms. Luong asked that School Committee, students, parents and employees come together because our students deserve it.

## Ms. Karen Colon-Hayes, City Councillor At Large

Ms. Colon-Hayes said that we are failing our teachers as well as students and our school system is suffering. Ms. Colon-Hayes continued that we need to help and work together to try and make this right. Ms. Colon-Hayes stressed that this does not happen in a bubble and it does not fall on just one person. Ms. Colon-Hayes said that we need to do better and that the only way we can come out of this is by working together.

### Ms. Penny Kalman, Salemwood School Teacher

Ms. Kalman spoke about Ms. Kristina Kisthart and Mr. Jacob Augenstern, Salemwood teachers doing outstanding work but were among those who received pink slips. Ms. Kalman asked how did we start a ago year with how racist the community is and then not follow through with one Pofessional Development to help us go through the motions to learn from it. Ms. Kalman said she is deeply disappointed with the direction that the district leadership has taken. Ms. Kalman concluded that they must do better and that we must keep expectations high for the leadership who is making major decisions for our children and students.

## Ms. Kristina Kisthart, Salemwood School Art Teacher

Ms. Kisthart said that she lived in Malden for most of her life and graduated from the Malden Public Schools, earned her college degrees and came back to teach at the Malden Public Schools. Ms. Kisthart continued by relating the work she has been doing for the schools and children in Malden including putting up art galleries to celebrate diversity and also working as the Art Educator and Director with Mr. Joe Levine from the Malden Recreation Department at Macdonald Stadium. Ms. Kisthart said she was let go for low performance although she was rated proficient in her evaluation. Ms. Kisthart hopes that the students of Malden would come back to work for the schools but asked why would they come back after seeing how the city treated her. Ms. Kisthart said this shows that Malden does not appreciate their own residents.

Ms. Amanda Maffeo, Salemwood School Teacher

Ms. Maffeo said that she is a lifelong resident of Malden and a graduate of the Malden education system. Ms. Maffeo said she was appalled when the Superintendent stated in the Boston Globe that teachers care more about adults than students. Ms. Maffeo continued that if that were true, the classrooms would be void of all educators. Ms. Maffeo said that educators live and breathe for their students, and meet the needs of their students every single day. Ms. Maffeo said that she was also disgusted with comments on social media that the union has xenophobic issues against the Superintendent. Ms. Maffeo continued that pulling a power move and laying off the large number of teachers when the district is not even in a budget crisis, is poor judgement that will not be forgotten. Ms. Maffeo said that this matter should have been handled as a team instead of just cleaning house. Ms. Maffeo questioned how can this be a budget issue when there are so many Assistants in Central Office. Ms. Maffeo said the resources could be used elsewhere in the schools.

## Ms. Lisa Morrison and Mr. Brian Morrison, 10 Lynn Street, Malden

Ms. Morrison said that they are parents of two children in the Malden Public Schools. Ms. Morrison continued that the first three years in a teaching position is a time of significant growth for any new classroom teacher. Teachers being renewed for the 4<sup>th</sup> year attain professional teacher status which means they have demonstrated proficiency in the performance standards, no longer require yearly improvement plans and the district cannot longer fire them with no cause. Teachers at this stage have established a foundation from which to build their teaching skills which results in less turnover and greater consistency in the classrooms. Ms. Morrison added that the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (DESE) website provides data that shows that in the past three years in Malden, the average number of teachers not retained in the same position from one year to the next was 49.3, which includes a yearly average of 18.6 non-renewals and 30.6 retirements/resignations. Ms. Morrison said that based on the data from Superintendent Noriega-Murphy, there are currently 48 teachers not being retained in the same position from this year to the next and this number only includes the non-renewals and does not include the 24 retirements or the multiple teacher resignations. Ms. Morrison said the average for this year is 78.8 teachers compared to the normal 49.3. Ms. Morrison elaborated on why this high turnover is not good for students.

### Ms. Dawn O'Toole, 130 Adams Street, Malden

Ms. O'Toole said that as a parent, it is disheartening to see so many teachers being let go. Ms. O'Toole added that this year, funding was not the issue. Ms. O'Toole mentioned that many of the teachers being let go received proficient status on their reviews. Ms. O'Toole continued that the pandemic not only affected students but also teachers. Ms. O'Toole asked why shouldn't we have compassion and care for those whom we ask to have compassion and care for our students.

## Ms. Rebecca Griffith, MHS Teacher

Ms. Griffith said that teaching in Malden has been a privilege and joy. Ms. Griffith said that massive staff reductions in a year when the district is struggling to fill over 40 of the most difficult to fill positions is not the way towards fully staffed and fully funded schools. Ms. Griffith asked for transparency, accountability and a clear action plan on how we save the schools. Ms. Griffith said that In Malden, we can make a choice to stand together and lead but it cannot be done alone.

## Ms. Tara Murphy Beardsley, Former School Committee Member

Ms. Beardsley said that the schools are already under-staffed and their needs are beyond great. Ms. Beardsley continued that it is difficult to hire educators and the number of educators exiting the

profession is very high. Ms. Beardsley asked about the plan for next year. Ms. Beardsley said the students need more consistency and not more changes.

Mayor Christenson thanked everyone who participated in the meeting as part of their efforts to make the community better. Mayor Christenson continued that a regular bi-weekly meeting with the MEA President, Superintendent Noriega-Murphy and himself is being scheduled to help with the situation. Mayor Christenson also recognized the work performed at the schools that helped over 400 students graduate from MHS the day before. Mayor Christenson said that to make things better, it starts with face-to-face communication and that everyone involved is committed to this effort even though it will take time.

Mayor Christenson called for a recess at 7:04 p.m. The meeting resumed at 7:08 p.m.

## **Superintendent's Report**

Superintendent Noriega-Murphy introduced the Tornado Travelers Club advisors, Ms. Shauna Campbell and Ms. Sarah Jones as well as Malden High School (MHS) Principal Mastrangelo who requested School Committee approval for tour destinations to Puerto Rico in April 2023 and Costa Rica in February 2024.

In response to Mr. McCarthy, Ms. Campbell said that both the tour guide and bus driver are CPR and First Aid certified. They also have information on how to contact emergency medical services in the respective countries should a need arise. Ms. Campbell said that forms have also been sent to students and caregivers to receive permission about medications that can be administered to them. In response to Mr. Weldai, Ms. Jones said this is the 8th year that the Tornado Travelers Club have organized these international tours. In response to Ms. Spadafora, Ms. Campbell said that the tour agency's insurance policy has been changed to allow for refunds in case of unforeseen circumstances or a need to change the destination if there is an issue with the original destination. Ms. Campbell responded to another question stating that the sooner they receive approval, the sooner they can begin fundraising for the trips. Superintendent Noriega-Murphy added that if any student contracts COVID-19 during the trip, an adult will stay behind with the student until the student is able to travel.

Mr. Weldai made the motion to approve the trips to Puerto Rico in April 2023 and Costa Rica in Feb 2024. Mr. McCarthy seconded and it was so VOTED. Motion passed unanimously.

## 1. Presentation on "Sleep Awareness Week"

Superintendent Noriega-Murphy invited 8<sup>th</sup> grade students, Liam Gallagher and Erin Grondin, Mr. Peter Rowley as well as Principal Garcia from Linden to provide more details about "Sleep Awareness Week". The students proposed to have a "Sleep Awareness Week" which is one week out of the school year and provided details of the initiative as well as the many benefits of sleep. Mr. Gray said it is a wonderful idea and asked them to consider taking seasons into account because it can affect sleep. Ms. Spadafora commented that the time spent on homework could also probably cut into sleep time. Mr. Weldai was supportive of the initiative and suggested to do the study with elementary school students as well. Liam Gallagher said this initiative will also be brought to 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> grade students. Mr. Bernard informed the students to reach out to him if they needed any help. Ms. Rose-Zeiberg said she was impressed with the work the students were doing.

Mr. Bernard made a motion to approve the "Sleep Awareness Week" initiative. Mr. Weldai seconded and it was so VOTED. Motion passed unanimously.

## 2. District Updates and Highlights

Superintendent Noriega-Murphy proceeded to provide updates and highlights which included the MHS graduation, enrollment which saw an increase of 701 students since the beginning of the year, attendance, Superintendent's entry plan and findings, next steps for 2022-2023 was also presented, Accelerated and Enriched Academic Program (AEAP) program for next year, assessment center, Malden Out-Of-School Time (MOST) programs, human resource matters and non-renewals, COVID-19 update and the equity audit. Superintendent Noriega-Murphy acknowledged the staff and students who passed away this year with a moment of silence. Superintendent Noriega-Murphy thanked everyone including the educators, staff and principals for their hard work. Superintendent Noriega-Murphy apologized if she did anything that seemed disrespectful and she encouraged communication in order to move forward.

Ms. Spadafora thanked Superintendent Noriega-Murphy for the detailed report every month. In response to a question from Ms. Spadafora, Superintendent Noriega-Murphy said that the AEAP working group led by Assistant Superintendents MacDonald and Doherty will meet once a month and report to the administration. In January 2023, an official report and recommendation will be presented to the School Committee. Ms. Spadafora asked how the district plans to bring more Out-Of-District (OOD) students back to the district. Superintendent Noriega-Murphy commented that the district is already starting to bring some of the OOD students back and the creation of the assessment center will help this process.

In response to Ms. Macklin's question about what the equity audit entails, Assistant Superintendent Doherty said that the equity audit which is funded by ESSER 3 includes meeting with stakeholders, spending time at each school, spending time with students, reviewing policies and procedures. The first meeting was held the previous week and Assistant Superintendent Doherty said that the team is encouraging more participants and School Committee members to join. Anyone interested should email <a href="equity@maldenps.org">equity@maldenps.org</a>. This is a very diverse group of stakeholders and they will be considering the proposals received from vendors in response to the RFP (Request for Proposals). Assistant Superintendent Doherty continued that after the selection process, the work will begin at the end of August and should be completed in December 2022. The audit results will inform the budget process for the 2023-2024 school year.

In response to Ms. Macklin, Mayor Christenson clarified that the School Committee Chair, Vice-Chair, Chair of the Budget Subcommittee attend the weekly meetings with the Superintendent. Mr. Weldai added that when he was the Vice-Chair, he attended the weekly between the Chair of the School Committee and the former Superintendent DeRuosi. Mr. Weldai was glad that Vice-Chair Ms. Spadafora is continuing to attend the meetings.

Mr. Weldai said he asked for the equity audit in November 2019 and there was a formalized motion for the equity audit in January 2020. Mr. Weldai said he was glad that it is finally happening. Mr. Weldai said that initiatives such as the future of the AEAP program as well as distribution of English Learners to neighborhood schools was talked about in previous years but it only came to fruition this year. Mr. Weldai said that Superintendent Noriega-Murphy

inherited a significant amount of work to do and a lot of mess to clean up. Mr. Weldai also said that it is difficult to address all these things at once.

Mr. Weldai said he wondered if the Superintendent was misquoted as he was in The Boston Globe. Mr. Weldai continued that he appreciated all the things that have been done. As evidenced by the comments earlier in the meeting, Mr. Weldai added that there is a lot more work to do in terms of communication and collaboration.

In response to Ms. Rose-Zeiberg, Superintendent Noriega-Murphy said that although the MOST program is fee-based, some vouchers will be provided. Superintendent Noriega-Murphy also added that the district is trying to avoid having waitlists for the MOST program by deploying staff from schools that have less after-school participation to schools with a greater need. In response to another question from Ms. Rose-Zeiberg, Superintendent Noriega-Murphy said that standardized testing will be used for the AEAP program. Superintendent Noriega-Murphy said that she will find out how many teachers signed up for the professional development for AEAP educators.

In reference to the remarkable improvement in Salemwood School's attendance rate, Mayor Christenson asked Principal Van Hyunh what was done to achieve this improvement. Principal Van Hyunh said that the students love to come to school and that the teachers are very dedicated. In response to Mayor Christenson, Superintendent Noriega-Murphy said that if the MOST program is not able to be staffed adequately, the district is looking for partners to provide after-school programming. Superintendent Noriega-Murphy said that a webinar around these topics has been scheduled next week.

### **Subcommittee Reports**

## 1. Technology and Student Resources – Mr. Gray

Mr. Gray said that subcommittee met to discuss and they unanimously voted to accept the Staff Acceptable Use Technology Policy. Superintendent Noriega-Murphy supported this proposal.

Mr. Gray made the motion to accept the Staff Acceptable Use Technology Policy. Mr. Bernard seconded. A roll call vote was taken.

Mr. Drummey voted YES

Mr. McCarthy voted YES

Ms. Spadafora voted YES

Ms. Macklin voted YES

Mr. Weldai voted YES

Mr. Grav voted YES

Mr. Bernard voted YES

Ms. Rose-Zeiberg voted YES

Mayor Christenson voted YES

Motion passed unanimously.

## 2. Policy and Procedures Subcommittee – Ms. Spadafora

Ms. Spadafora said the Policy and Procedures Subcommittee met to discuss and voted unanimously on the PreK-12 Program of Studies, PreK-12 Handbook and Code of Conduct. Ms. Spadafora said it is equitable that there is one Program of Studies and Handbook for the entire district.

Ms. Spadafora made the motion to approve the PreK-12 Program of Studies. Mr. Bernard seconded. A roll call vote was taken.

Mr. Drummey voted YES

Mr. McCarthy voted YES

Ms. Spadafora voted YES

Ms. Macklin voted YES

Mr. Weldai voted YES

Mr. Gray voted YES

Mr. Bernard voted YES

Ms. Rose-Zeiberg voted YES

Mayor Christenson voted YES

Motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Spadafora made the motion to approve the PreK-12 handbook and the Code of Conduct.

Mr. Bernard seconded. A roll call vote was taken.

Mr. Drummey voted YES

Mr. McCarthy voted YES

Ms. Spadafora voted YES

Ms. Macklin voted YES

Mr. Weldai voted YES

Mr. Grav voted YES

Mr. Bernard voted YES

Ms. Rose-Zeiberg voted YES

Mayor Christenson voted YES

Motion passed unanimously.

Superintendent Noriega-Murphy that a new format will be developed for School Improvement Plans next year which will use targets that were created this year to measure growth yearly. Superintendent Noriega-Murphy thanked all the principals for their work on the school improvement plans. Ms. Spadafora agreed that a yearly school improvement plan would be better.

Ms. Spadafora made a motion to approve the school improvement plans for next year. Mr. Drummey seconded. A roll call vote was taken.

Mr. Drummey voted YES

Mr. McCarthy voted YES

Ms. Spadafora voted YES

Ms. Macklin voted YES

Mr. Weldai voted YES

Mr. Gray voted YES

Mr. Bernard voted YES

Ms. Rose-Zeiberg voted YES

Mayor Christenson voted YES

Motion passed unanimously.

### 3. Budget Subcommittee – Mr. Weldai

Mr. Weldai said that the Budget Subcommittee met numerous times over several months and a public forum was held last week.

### **Motions and Resolutions**

### 1. 2022-2023 Proposed School Budget – Mr. Weldai

Mr. Weldai said that he would like to make a small amendment to the budget because the Instructional Technology Director resigned recently and since this position is not going to be filled, Mr. Weldai would like to propose that the salary be reallocated to two School Adjustment Counselors.

Mr. McCarthy asked where the two School Adjustment Counselors would be placed. Mr. Weldai responded that since there is already a plan developed with the Superintendent and the Assistant Superintendent of Finance and Operations for an additional School Adjustment Counselor at MHS, these two School Adjustment Counselors would be district-wide for the K-8 schools. In response to Mr. Bernard, Mr. Weldai said that the Instructional Technology Director position is not well defined and that for budget deliberations, the two School Adjustment Counselor positions were deemed to be more important for students in the district. Mr. Gray said that the Instructional Technology Director position was not really a necessary position because it had nothing to do with the actual running of the school department network or the infrastructure.

Mr. Weldai made the motion to make an amendment to the budget to reallocate the salary of the Instructional Technology Director to 2 School Adjustment Counselors. Mr. Bernard seconded. A roll call vote was taken.

Mr. Drummey voted YES

Mr. McCarthy voted YES

Ms. Spadafora voted YES

Ms. Macklin voted YES

Mr. Weldai voted YES

Mr. Grav voted YES

Mr. Bernard voted YES

Ms. Rose-Zeiberg voted YES

Mayor Christenson voted YES

Motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Weldai thanked the members of the Budget Subcommittee and the Assistant Superintendent of Finance and Operations for their work on the budget. Mr. Weldai said that there is transparency in how the ESSER funds have been used.

Ms. Rose-Zeiberg asked why the foundation budget of \$105,452,144 that the school is required to spend is not part of the proposed budget of \$80,057,000. Assistant Superintendent of Finance and Operations, Ms. Toni Mertz said that the difference between the foundation budget and the allocated budget covers the education of all the Malden students in the charter school,

vocational school and Essex Tech School. It also covers the indirect cost that the city absorbs on behalf of the schools which includes administration cost, facilities cost, health insurance cost, life insurance cost and so on.

Mayor Christenson said that Malden is above the net school spending level. Mr. Bernard said that in the efforts of getting more funding for schools, there are some political candidates for the upcoming election season who advocate strongly for education. Mr. Bernard added that the Fair Share Amendment is another manner in which there would be more funding for education.

Mayor Christenson mentioned that the city's finance team led by Mr. Ron Hogan and Mr. Chuck Ranaghan have been working hard on this matter too. They feel that while the state has done a decent job on the Chapter 70 funding, the formula that cities and towns use to put towards education needs to be reviewed. The formula that is being used has not been updated for about 20 years and the factors used to determine the formula do not accurately affect the true situation, which in turn negatively affects the schools. Mayor Christenson continued that a number of cities and towns have been campaigning to revise the formula.

Mr. Weldai made the motion to adopt the 2022-2023 budget. Mr. Drummey seconded. A roll call vote was taken.

Mr. Drummey voted YES

Mr. McCarthy voted NO

Ms. Spadafora voted YES

Ms. Macklin voted YES

Mr. Weldai voted YES

Mr. Gray voted YES

Mr. Bernard voted YES

Ms. Rose-Zeiberg voted YES

Mayor Christenson voted YES

Motion passed with 8 votes in favor and 1 vote against.

## 2. Staff Acceptable Use Technology Policy – Mr. Gray

This motion was voted on at an earlier segment of the meeting.

## 3. School Improvement Plans – Ms. Spadafora

This motion was voted on at an earlier segment of the meeting.

## 4. Program of Studies PreK-12 – Ms. Spadafora

This motion was voted on at an earlier segment of the meeting.

### 5. Handbook PreK-12 – Ms. Spadafora

This motion was voted on at an earlier segment of the meeting.

## 6. Code of Conduct PreK-12 – Ms. Spadafora

This motion was voted on at an earlier segment of the meeting.

### **Personal Privilege**

# **Adjournment**

Ms. Spadafora made a motion to adjourn at 9:01 p.m. Mr. Bernard seconded and it was so VOTED. Motion passed unanimously.

I certify that a notice of this meeting was filed with the Clerk of the City of Malden in the manner provided under Chapter 39, Section 23A of the General Laws.

Shirley Dorai, Clerk